# Executive and Managerial Benchmark Compensation Study 

Board of Supervisors Personnel Committee Meeting

## Agenda

- Background
- Study Overview
- Study Results
- Implementation Steps
- Discussion


## Background <br> Current Environment

- Market has changed since the onset of COVID-19
- More competitive salaries offered by surrounding jurisdictions and other employers
- Internal equity/alignment issues
- New hires are often brought in at or above long-serving County employees
- Compression issues between employees and their supervisors
- Impacts on morale/performance


## Background <br> Maintaining Market Competitiveness

- Benchmark studies are completed annually for uniformed pay scales and non-uniformed job classes in pay grades S-30 and below
- The Board's long-standing pay philosophy is to be at the midpoint of the market average
- Job classes are generally recommended for regrades when the Fairfax midpoint is below $95 \%$ of the market average midpoint
- Comparator jurisdictions:
- City of Alexandria
- Arlington County
- District of Columbia
- Loudoun County
- Montgomery County
- Prince George's County
- Prince William County
- Targeted studies are conducted when necessary for more indepth analysis



## Background <br> Recent Actions to Address Pay, Retention and Recruitment

- Benchmark study regrades for pay grades S-30 and below have been conducted and implemented on a regular basis except when postponed due to the pandemic
- 49\% of benchmarks have been regraded since 2014
- FY 2023 benchmark regrades for S-30 and below were increased to 5\% per grade and accelerated to March 2022 to address recruitment and retention
- Full compensation program in FY 2023
- Hiring incentives ranging from $\$ 2,000$ to $\$ 2,500$ for hard to fill classifications such as nurses, behavioral health specialists, developmental disability specialists, and CDL classifications
- Bonuses of \$1,000 for merit employees in May 2021 and November 2021
- Salary equity reviews in progress to address retention and recruitment challenges


## Background <br> Executive and Managerial Market Competitiveness

- E scale positions and job classes at or above the S-31 pay grade have not been holistically reviewed since 2009
- These job classes have historically been reviewed separately through targeted pay studies with extensive consultant support, and are not typically adjusted as part of the annual benchmark study
- Some individual job classes have been adjusted to address specific recruitment issues, but most adjustments have been held pending the completion of a comprehensive study
- Positions include directors, deputy directors, division directors, other agency management, and high-level individual contributors


## Current Issues and Challenges

- Filling executive and management positions has often required hiring at or near the maximum of the existing pay ranges


## External hires since January 2020:

- 5 of 7 agency directors hired above $80 \%$ of the pay scale
- 5 of 6 agency deputy directors hired above $90 \%$ of the pay scale
- More than half of other S-31+ employees hired above $70 \%$ of the pay scale



## Current Issues and Challenges

- Filling executive and management positions has often required hiring at or near the maximum of the existing pay ranges
- Annual benchmark study regrades have compressed job series, with some having little difference in grades between management positions and those reporting to them

Public Health Nurse Series


## Executive and Managerial Benchmark Study Overview

- The County Executive directed a county-wide compensation and organizational review of Executive and Managerial level occupations
- Began in 2018 as a consultant-led effort
- Project shifted to staff, but delayed due to pandemic and other challenges
- Methodology
- External benchmark data from comparator jurisdictions
- Internal review of positions and organizational structure


## Benchmark Data

- Benchmark data for director positions indicates that Fairfax is generally below market
- Benchmark data for S scale positions graded S-31 and above demonstrates many job classes below market
- Accurate comparisons are difficult as jurisdictions are organized differently
- These comparisons do not take into account differences in scope, span of control and complexity of these types of positions as compared to our surrounding jurisdictions
- These classes were not adjusted as part of the FY 2023 annual benchmark study

| Job Title | Market <br> Position |
| :--- | :---: |
| Assistant Director of Public Safety Communications | $80 \%$ |
| Assistant Director of Vehicle Services | $92 \%$ |
| Assistant Real Estate Director | $89 \%$ |
| Engineer VI | $93 \%$ |
| Finance Director | $92 \%$ |
| Human Resources Director | $91 \%$ |
| Information Technology Director | $95 \%$ |
| Park Authority Director | $95 \%$ |
| Planning and Development Director | $95 \%$ |
| Public Safety Communications Director | $88 \%$ |
| Public Works and Environmental Services Director | $96 \%$ |

## Park Authority Director Benchmark Data



|  | Prince William | Fairfax | Alexandria | Loudoun | Arlington |
| :--- | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Population | 482,204 | $1,150,309$ | 159,467 | 420,659 | 238,643 |
| Number of Parks | 87 | 420 | 233 | 39 | 149 |
| Park Land (in acres) | 5,337 | 23,632 | 566 | 3,141 | 922 |

## Public Safety Communications Assistant Director Benchmark Data



## Internal Position Review

|  | Community Services Board | Family Services | Health* | Housing and Community Developmen | Neighborhoo and <br> Community |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Director | E-13 | E-13 |  |  | E-13 |
|  |  |  |  | E-12 |  |
| Deputy Director |  |  |  | S-37 |  |
|  | S-35 | S-35 | S-35 |  |  |
| Next Level of Manager |  | S-34 |  |  | S-34 |
|  |  |  | S-33 | S-33 | S-33 |

## Benchmark Study Results

## -Simplify pay scales

- Align similar jobs
"Compete with the market


## Simplify

- Reduce number of grades for appointed positions
- Only 8 of 14 grades on E scale currently in use
- Establish consistent 10\% increments
- Create more meaningful distinctions between grades
- Current E scale increments are approximately $5 \%$, but vary from $2 \%$ to $10.6 \%$




## Simplify

- Create a pay scale for agency management explicitly linked to the A scale
- Highest pay grade, M-5, equivalent to A-3 pay grade
- Consistent 10\% increments
- High level individual contributors and supervisors remain on the $S$ scale



## Align

- Ensure alignment of Appointed scale with Management scale (e.g., a Director graded at A-5 will have their Deputy Director at M-5 grade)

Director


## Compete

- Adjust salary ranges based on available benchmarking data
- Recognize differences in job scope
- Provide additional capacity for salary growth
- Establish consistent methods to maintain market competitiveness
- Include S-31+ positions that remain on S scale in annual benchmark adjustments for job series
- Benchmark A and M scales annually against competitor jurisdictions' executive and management pay structures

| Job Title | Market <br> Position <br> (Before) | Market <br> Position <br> (After) |
| :--- | :---: | :---: |
| Assistant Director of Public Safety Communications | $80 \%$ | $106 \%$ |
| Assistant Director of Vehicle Services | $92 \%$ | $105 \%$ |
| Assistant Real Estate Director | $89 \%$ | $98 \%$ |
| Engineer VI | $93 \%$ | $98 \%$ |
| Finance Director | $92 \%$ | $101 \%$ |
| Human Resources Director | $91 \%$ | $110 \%$ |
| Information Technology Director | $95 \%$ | $110 \%$ |
| Park Authority Director | $95 \%$ | $109 \%$ |
| Planning and Development Director | $95 \%$ | $115 \%$ |
| Public Safety Communications Director | $88 \%$ | $106 \%$ |
| Public Works and Environmental Services Director | $96 \%$ | $110 \%$ |

## Compete <br> Park Authority Director

| \$273,645 |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $\$ 210,454$ | $\$ 228,572$ |  |  |

## Compete

## Public Safety Communications Assistant Director



## New Executive and Managerial Pay Scales

Appointed (A scale)

| Grade | Minimum | Midpoint | Maximum |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| A6 | $\$ 162,640$ | $\$ 219,564$ | $\$ 276,488$ |
| A5 | $\$ 147,854$ | $\$ 199,603$ | $\$ 251,352$ |
| A4 | $\$ 134,413$ | $\$ 181,458$ | $\$ 228,502$ |
| A3 | $\$ 122,194$ | $\$ 164,961$ | $\$ 207,729$ |
| A2 | $\$ 111,085$ | $\$ 149,965$ | $\$ 188,845$ |
| A1 | $\$ 100,986$ | $\$ 136,332$ | $\$ 171,677$ |

Managerial (M scale)

| Grade | Minimum | Midpoint | Maximum |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| -- | -- | - | -- |
| M5 | $\$ 122,194$ | $\$ 164,961$ | $\$ 207,729$ |
| M4 | $\$ 111,085$ | $\$ 149,965$ | $\$ 188,845$ |
| M3 | $\$ 100,986$ | $\$ 136,332$ | $\$ 171,677$ |
| M2 | $\$ 91,806$ | $\$ 123,938$ | $\$ 156,070$ |
| M1 | $\$ 83,460$ | $\$ 112,671$ | $\$ 141,882$ |

## Department of Transportation Impact of Changes



## Department of Public Safety Communications Impact of Changes



## Fiscal Impact

- The average adjustment for employees impacted by this market rate adjustment is 4.3\%
- High-level individual contributors and supervisors that are currently in grades S-31 or above and found to be out of market will be moved to a higher grade on the S scale
- The standard adjustment of $5 \%$ per grade will be applied
- Managers that are currently in grades S-31 or above will be moved to the M scale, while appointed officials that are currently on the E scale will be moved to the A scale
- Adjustments will use a reduced calculation (half the percentage increase in pay grade minimum).
- After accounting for agencies that can absorb the fiscal impact, the partial-year General Fund impact is estimated at $\$ 2.0$ million and will be included in the FY 2022 Carryover Review
- The full-year General Fund impact of $\$ 3.8$ million will be included in the FY 2024 Advertised Budget Plan
- The full-year cost to all funds is estimated at $\$ 5.0$ million


## Implementation Steps

- Detailed information regarding benchmark study results for these positions will be posted on the DHR FairfaxNet site
- Promotional policies and policies regarding the new M scale will be updated
- Personnel regulation changes will be brought forward on October 18
- Position grade adjustments targeted to be effective October 2022
- Continued equity reviews
- Inclusion of these positions in FY 2024 annual benchmark study

